**Reviewer A: COMMENTS:**

All the changes have been incorporated in the revised manuscript as reviewers suggested.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Sr. no. | Comment | Response/action |
| (i) | After abbreviating first time should use abbreviation later in the text. e.g. soil organic carbon at first place as SOC, use abbreviation in text afterwards e.g line 64 and 113. This should be followed for other abbreviations too like DOC, TOC etc.  | Agreed and modified  |
| (ii) | Line 13:…..environmentalists is to…… | Done |
| (iii) | Line 16:……Objective of this study……. | Done |
| (iv) | Line 68: Are “red Murree’s shale” and “Murree’s shale” same? | Yes, red Murree’s shale and Murree’s shale are the same |
| (v) | Line 70: About humid and semiarid climate, please indicate annual precipitation and annual average temperature.  | Incorporated  |
| (vi) | Line 69: For coniferous forest, please describe the type of typical coniferous trees.  | Incorporated  |
| (vii) | Line 70: “developed also developed” is “also developed”.  | Done as suggested  |
| (viii) | Line 71: What are the main cultivars there?  | Incorporated in the text |
| (ix) | Line 77-78: “Total extractable iron” is not total but DCB extractable.  | Agreed and suggestion incorporated |
| (x) | Line 110: ……Typic Hapludolls due to weathering processes while……. | Modified as suggested  |
| (xi) | Line 114: …….organisms and relief 26. | Modified  |
| (xii) | Line 116: “BW/BA” is “Bw/BA”?  | True and done  |
| (xiii) | Line 117-118: correlated with DOC (r 0.89). | Done as suggested  |
| (xiv) | Line 122: In addition to the correlation coefficient, you should indicate the significance level. | Significant level is given  |
| (xv) | Line 120: …..As Typic Hapludolls occurs under humid……. | Incorporated  |
| (xvi) | Line 135:…. carbon stocks as compared to….. | Done as suggested  |
| (xvii) | Line 138:…. correlated with DOC….. | Ok agreed and done  |
| (xviii) | Line 151:…. than humid regions 33. | Done  |
| (xix) | Line 156:.…….lower carbon stocks. | Done |
| (xx) | Line 156: However macro…….. | Done  |
| (xxi) | Line 161:……total organic carbon (TOC) and DOC… | Incorporated  |
| (xxii) | Line 163:…. first three layers in…….. | Done as suggested  |
| (xxiii) | Line 166:……respectively (Table. 1). Although the soils under arid or semi arid climate are vulnerable to degradation but work in favor of carbon stratification in soil profile as the residence time………. | Done as suggested  |
| (xxiv) | Line 173:… stock varied with climate, land use and soil development. Soil developed in humid climate under forest had….. | Done as suggested  |

**Corresponding Author**

Dr. Ayaz Mehmood